

Phytoremediation: novel approaches to cleaning up polluted soils Ute Krämer

Environmental pollution with metals and xenobiotics is a global problem, and the development of phytoremediation technologies for the plant-based clean-up of contaminated soils is therefore of significant interest. Phytoremediation technologies are currently available for only a small subset of pollution problems, such as arsenic. Arsenic removal employs naturally selected hyperaccumulator ferns, which accumulate very high concentrations of arsenic specifically in aboveground tissues. Elegant two-gene transgenic approaches have been designed for the development of mercury or arsenic phytoremediation technologies. In a plant that naturally hyperaccumulates zinc in leaves, approximately ten key metal homeostasis genes are expressed at very high levels. This outlines the extent of change in gene activities needed in the engineering of transgenic plants for soil clean-up. Further analysis and discovery of genes for phytoremediation will benefit from the recent development of segregating populations for a genetic analysis of naturally selected metal hyperaccumulation in plants, and from comprehensive ionomics data - multi-element concentration profiles from a large number of Arabidopsis mutants.

Addresses

Max Planck Institute of Molecular Plant Physiology, Am Mühlenberg 1, D-14476 Golm, Germany

Corresponding author: Krämer, Ute (kraemer@mpimp-golm.mpg.de)

Current Opinion in Biotechnology 2005, 16:133-141

This review comes from a themed issue on Plant biotechnology Edited by Dirk Inzé

Available online 2nd March 2005

0958-1669/\$ - see front matter © 2005 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

DOI 10.1016/j.copbio.2005.02.006

Introduction

Pollution with metals and xenobiotics is a global environmental problem that has resulted from mining, industrial, agricultural and military practices [1]. Many pollutants accumulate in the food chain and threaten human health. In wealthy industrialized countries contamination is often highly localized, and the pressure to use contaminated land and water for agricultural food production or for human consumption, respectively, is minimal. However, soil and water contamination is widespread in Eastern Europe, and is increasingly recognized as dramatic in large parts of the developing world, primarily in India [2] and China [3]. Although the avoidance of pollution should certainly be the primary objective, this principle has not generally been followed in the past. The clean-up of polluted soils and waters is very costly, and for many pollutants no feasible technologies are yet available. Plants possess highly efficient systems that acquire and concentrate nutrients as well as numerous metabolic activities, all of which are ultimately powered by photosynthesis. The term phytoremediation has been coined for the concept that plants could be used for low-cost environmental clean-up and this has attracted considerable attention in the past decade [4-6]. During the 1980s, the US Government initiated a large program for the development of environmental clean-up technologies (The Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act or Superfund), which has accelerated the growth of a new productive research field worldwide. As a result, researchers have come to learn that the development of phytoremediation technologies requires a thorough understanding of the underlying processes at the genetic, molecular, biochemical, physiological and agronomic levels.

This is a review of recent developments in basic and applied research relevant for the plant-based clean-up of soils contaminated with trace metals and metalloids.

Available phytoremediation approaches and technologies

There are two distinct strategies in soil phytoremediation, phytostabilization and phytoextraction [5]. The former is used to provide a cover of vegetation for a moderately to heavily contaminated site, thus preventing wind and water erosion. Plants suitable for phytostabilization develop an extensive root system, provide good soil cover, possess tolerance to the contaminant metals, and ideally immobilize the contaminants in the rhizosphere. Phytostabilization is often performed using species from plant communities occurring on local contaminated sites.

The most effective but also technically the most difficult phytoremediation strategy is phytoextraction. It involves the cultivation of tolerant plants that concentrate soil contaminants in their above-ground tissues. At the end of the growth period, plant biomass is harvested, dried or incinerated, and the contaminant-enriched material is deposited in a special dump or added into a smelter. The energy gained from burning of the biomass could support the profitability of the technology, if the resultant fumes can be cleaned appropriately. For phytoextraction to be worthwhile, the dry biomass or the ash derived from above ground tissues of a phytoremediator crop should contain substantially higher concentrations of the contaminant than the polluted soil. To achieve this, several bottleneck processes limiting trace element accumulation in plants have to be resolved, including the mobilization of poorly available contaminant trace elements in the soil, root uptake, symplastic mobility and xylem loading, as well as detoxification and storage inside the shoot [7^{••}].

Metal hyperaccumulator plants are naturally capable of accumulating trace elements, primarily Ni, Zn, Cd, As or Se, in their above-ground tissues, without developing any toxicity symptoms [8]. The concentrations of these elements in dry leaf biomass are usually up to 100-fold higher than the concentrations in the soil [4]. Characteristically, the shoot:root ratio of concentrations of the hyperaccumulated trace element is above unity [9,10^{••},11^{••}]. Although metal hyperaccumulator plants therefore appear to have ideal properties for phytoextraction, most of these plants produce little biomass and are thus primarily used as model organisms for research purposes. The biomass production of a few hyperaccumulator plants has been judged sufficient for phytomining (the use of plants to extract and concentrate inorganic substances of economic value from soils) [12] or phytoremediation; for example, the brake fern Pteris vittata accumulated up to 7500 μ g g⁻¹ As on a contaminated site [13], without showing toxicity symptoms. One fern cultivar is available commercially for As phytoextraction (http://www.edenspace.com/index.html), and promising field trials have been conducted [14[•]]. Chelator-assisted phytoremediation is also available commercially. This approach is based on the application of chelators such as EDTA (ethylenediamine tetraacetate) to solubilize poorly available metals (e.g. lead) in the soil, followed by the largely passive accumulation of metal complexes in plant shoots with the transpiration stream [5].

Because of their extensive root system, their high biomass and low-input cultivation, trees are attractive phytoremediators. Metal accumulation is generally poor, however, especially in the wood. Recent genome sequencing, the development of genomics tools, and the ease of genetic transformation of poplar might open up new avenues for the use of trees in phytoremediation [7^{••}].

Breakthroughs in phytoremediation: novel transgenic approaches

A variant of phytoextraction is phytovolatilization, whereby the contaminant is not primarily accumulated in above-ground tissues, but is instead transformed by the plant into a volatile compound that is released into the atmosphere. In some groundbreaking work, the detoxification of highly toxic organomercurial compounds and subsequent volatilization of elemental mercury were successfully engineered in plants. For this purpose, modified bacterial *merA* and *merB* genes were introduced into several plant species including *Arabidopsis*, tobacco and



Chemical reactions in transgenic phytoremediation. (a) The detoxification and volatilization of organomercurials. (b) Arsenate detoxification and immobilization. (c) Selenite detoxification. Gene names are explained in the text. AdoMet, S-adenosylmethionine; GSH, glutathione (reduced); GS-SG, oxidized glutathione; Me, methyl; SMM, S-methylmethionine.

poplar [15,16]. The MerB protein is an organomercurial lyase that catalyzes the removal of Hg(II) from organic mercury compounds (e.g. methylmercury; Figure 1a). The MerA protein, a mercuric ion reductase, reduces Hg(II) to the volatile elemental form Hg(0) using NADPH as an electron donor. Transgenic plants transformed with both merA and merB were remarkably tolerant to organic mercury compounds and Hg(II). With respect to soil clean-up, the approach is still limited by a generally very low solubility of mercurial compounds in the soil solution. The reaction catalyzed by MerB limited the performance of the plants transformed with merA and merB. Enhanced specific in planta MerB activities were achieved by targeting the MerB protein to the cell wall or to the endoplasmatic reticulum, where the apolar organomercurials are believed to accumulate [17]. Targeting the MerB enzyme to the cell wall is an example for the transfer of a phytoremediation-active compound to the extracytoplasmic surface of plant cells. Similar approaches may help to solve the problem of low uptake rates of contaminants by plant cells, which still limits all emerging phytoextraction technologies. In order for transgenic phytoremediation to become more widely accepted, the development and implementation of biological encapsulation strategies will be of high value. Biological encapsulation is a term to describe procedures that dramatically decrease the probability of the spread of a transgene from a genetically modified crop to natural plant populations, for example by introducing the transgene into the chloroplast genome instead of the nuclear genome [18].

A second example further illustrates how well-conceived plant engineering strategies have been designed based on microbial detoxification pathways. In plants, As is taken up as arsenate (AsO_4^{3-}) by phosphate uptake systems [19]. Arabidopsis plants were generated that overexpress an Escherichia coli arsenate reductase ArsC (Figure 1b), which reduces arsenate to arsenite (AsO₃³⁻) using glutathione as the electron donor [20**]. Because arsenite possesses a high affinity for thiol groups and is thus likely to be bound and immobilized inside the cells where it is formed, the *arsC* gene was introduced downstream of the soybean SRS1 (small subunit of Rubisco 1) promoter, which confers shoot-specific, light-induced expression. The rationale behind this was to keep As immobilization in the root to a minimum in order not to interfere with the translocation of As to the shoot. The resulting transgenic plants were hypersensitive to arsenate, which was attributed to the depletion of the glutathione pool and to the high affinity of arsenite for binding to protein thiol groups. Arabidopsis thaliana plants transformed with arsC and an additional second transgene, which encoded the E. coli γ -glutamylcysteine synthetase (γ -ECS) expressed under a constitutive actin (ACT2) promoter, were more tolerant to arsenate than the wild-type or single γ -ECS transformants. Double-transformant lines accumulated up to 3.4-fold higher shoot As concentrations than wild-type

plants on agarose-based media (Table 1). The efficiency of this approach in As phytoextraction remains to be tested on contaminated soils. The expression of ArsC in plants also increases Cd tolerance and accumulation [21^{••}].

Alternatively, strategies to engineer plants for phytoextraction can be designed based on naturally selected metal hyperaccumulation mechanisms. Transgenic A. thaliana plants expressing a selenocysteine methyltransferase (SMTA) isolated from the Se hyperaccumulator Astragalus bisulcatus accumulated methylselenocysteine and contained up to eightfold higher Se concentrations than wild-type plants, when grown on a soil supplemented with selenite (SeO₃^{2–}; see Figure 1c and Table 1) [22[•]]. However, the transgene did not confer tolerance to or enhanced accumulation of Se when the metalloid was provided in the predominant chemical form present in soils, selenate $(\hat{SeO_4}^{2-})$. The next important step will be to enhance the rate-limiting conversion of selenate to selenite by the plants. In Brassica juncea seedlings expressing the same SMTA protein, another research group observed slight selenate tolerance and an approximately fivefold increase in Se accumulation when plants were exposed to selenate [23[•]]. They report slightly enhanced dimethyl diselenide volatilization from mature transgenic B. juncea plants exposed to selenite or selenate.

Novel insights from basic research

In the past few years, substantial progress has been made in elucidating the mechanistic basis of the homeostasis and detoxification of metals and metalloids in plants. Insights into the mechanisms of naturally selected plant trace element tolerance and hyperaccumulation have also been gained. On the basis of this work, improved engineering strategies can now be devised. For example, the current transgenic approach in As phytoremediation (described above) could be combined with the expression of phosphate transporters, which appear to be the major uptake pathway for the chemically similar arsenate anions

Gene(s)	Product/function	Source	Target	Expression	Maximum effect ^a	Root medium
arsC	Arsenate reductase	E. coli	Tobacco	Shoot	1.4-fold Cd	Hydroponic
<i>ar</i> sC and γ-ECS	Arsenate reductase and γ -EC synthetase	E. coli E. coli	Arabidopsis	Shoot and constitutive	Threefold As from AsO ₄ ³⁻	Agar
SMTA	Selenocysteine Methyltransferase	A. bisulcatus	Arabidopsis	Constitutive	Eightfold Se from SeO_3^{2-}	Amended soil
SMTA	Selenocysteine methyltransferase	A. bisulcatus	Brassica juncea	Constitutive	^b Fivefold from SeO ₄ ²⁻ ^c Volatilization	Agar Sand
YCF1	Vacuolar sequestration of GSH-conjugates	S. cerevisiae	Arabidopsis	Constitutive	1.4-fold Pb, 1.5-fold Cd	Gravel/hydroponic
HMA4	Cellular metal efflux	A. thaliana	Arabidopsis	Constitutive	^d Twofold Zn, 1.4-fold Cd	Hydroponic

^aThe 'maximum effect' is the maximum concentration increase observed in shoot dry biomass, relative to control plants not expressing the transgene. For a summary of earlier data see [6]. ^bValue likely to refer to concentration in whole seedlings. ^cThe volatilized compound is dimethyl diselenide (MeSe-SeMe). ^dData were from a single transformant line only.

Table 1

in the roots. There may even be the possibility to isolate mutant or variant phosphate uptake systems with an enhanced affinity for arsenate. The root systems of the As hyperaccumulating fern P. vittata possess a higher affinity for arsenate uptake than those of a related nonaccumulator fern species [24[•]]. A suppression of endogenous arsenate reduction in roots may serve to enhance root-to-shoot translocation of As [20^{••},25], and the overexpression of a glutathione-conjugate pump in the leaves could increase the capacity for detoxification of As(III)glutathione complexes in the vacuole. Finally, phytochelatins [26] — metal-chelating molecules of the general formula $(\gamma$ -GluCys)_nGly (where n = 2 to 11) synthesized by the ubiquitous plant enzyme phytochelatin synthase [27-29] — are known to contribute to As detoxification in As-sensitive [30], As-tolerant [31], and As hyperaccumulator plants [32°,33°]. It is interesting to note that the ability to synthesize phytochelatins reduces the extent of cellular As tolerance conferred by expression of the cellular arsenite efflux transporter ScAcr3p in Schizosaccharomyces pombe [34[•]].

Genomics approaches are increasingly being employed in phytoremediation-related research. Recently, powerful 'ionomics' screens have been initiated [35^{••},36]. These involve unbiased multi-element profiling in A. thaliana mutant populations to identify mutants with altered elemental composition of rosette leaves. These and similar screens will serve to identify novel genes with a key role in metal accumulation. Using A. thaliana oligonucleotide microarrays, cross-species transcript profiling was employed to compare A. thaliana and a closely related Znand Cd-tolerant Zn hyperaccumulating accession of Arabidopsis halleri [10**,11**]. This study confirmed on a genome-wide scale what had been observed earlier for single genes in several different hyperaccumulator species [37–39,40^{••},41[•]]: several metal homeostasis genes are constitutively expressed at very high levels in metal hyperaccumulators, when compared with closely related non-accumulators. In A. halleri, these include genes encoding several membrane transporter proteins of the ZRT-IRT-related protein (ZIP) family (zinc-regulated transporter, iron-regulated transporter) [42], which are likely to mediate zinc influx into the cytoplasm, and two isoforms of the enzyme nicotianamine synthase. These genes are expressed at low levels or only upregulated under conditions of zinc deficiency in A. thaliana. Other genes found to be constitutively expressed at high levels in the hyperaccumulator species A. halleri encode membrane transport proteins of the HMA (heavy metal P-type ATPase) family of P_{1B}-type metal ATPases, which are potentially involved in metal export into the apoplast for metal detoxification or for root-to-shoot metal translocation in the xylem. Finally, the transcript analyses implicated a metal tolerance protein 1 (MTP1)-like protein of the so-called cation diffusion facilitator family, which contributes to the sequestration of Zn ions primarily in leaf vacuoles (see below). Global transcript analyses of metal hyperaccumulation and associated tolerance in A. halleri are thus consistent with an involvement of several major genes, as supported by preliminary genetic analyses [43[•],44,45[•]]. Collating the available data shows that in several cases homologues of the same A. thaliana gene are overexpressed in various hyperaccumulator species: A. halleri (hyperaccumulating primarily Zn), Thlaspi caerulescens (Zn), a different accession of T. caerulescens (Cd, Zn), and Thlaspi goesingense (Ni). Together with site-directed and random mutagenesis approaches, the comparison of amino acid sequences of metal transporters from several hyperaccumulator species might be a starting point in the identification of determinants of differential metal specificities [46]. For example, a sequence comparison of the IRT1 protein from A. thaliana and related proteins from T. caerulescens accessions differing in their Cd accumulation might help to identify regions and amino acids that specify Cd transport or exclusion [47[•]].

Recent work (see also above) suggests a role for nicotianamine as a chelator conferring cellular tolerance to Ni [48[•]] and Zn [10^{••},11^{••}] in a Zn hyperaccumulating accession of T. caerulescens and in A. halleri, respectively. Nicotianamine synthase catalyzes the biosynthesis of nicotianamine from three molecules of S-adenosylmethionine, releasing three molecules of S-methyladenosine as a by-product [49-51]. Nicotianamine is a nonproteinogenic amino acid metal chelator that is ubiquitous in higher plants. Each nicotianamine molecule is able to chelate a metal ion with high affinity via three carboxylate groups and the free electron pairs of a maximum of three amino groups [52]. In the past, nicotianamine was identified as a chelator essential for the intercellular and long-distance transport of Fe, Zn and Cu in plants. It is also an intermediate in the biosynthesis of phytosiderophores, which participate in the mobilization of rhizosphere Fe(III) by roots of graminaceous plants [53].

As the molecular inventory of metal hyperaccumulation is gradually reaching completion, it is vital to determine the site of action and the precise function of the implicated proteins. Researchers have begun to generate the tools required for a genetic analysis of metal hyperaccumulation. For example, an F2 and a backcross 1 population segregating for metal tolerance and hyperaccumulation, respectively, have been generated by crossing A. halleri with the closely related non-tolerant non-accumulating Arabidopsis lyrata ssp. petraea [44,45[•]]. One such population has been used to demonstrate that two genes of A. halleri, which are closely related to the A. thaliana MTP1 gene and encode almost identical membrane transport proteins capable of transporting Zn²⁺ into the vacuole (see above), co-segregate with zinc tolerance [40^{••}]. This highlights the major importance of the central vacuole of plant cells as a compartment for metal detoxification

Figure 2



Model of Cd partitioning. (a) Cd partitioning in YCF1-overexpressing transgenic A. thaliana. Cd2+ enters plant cells primarily through non-specific transport systems (not shown). Inside the cell a fraction of Cd(II) binds to thiol groups of glutathione (GSH) molecules as ligands. The complex is a substrate for YCF1. In root vacuolar membranes, YCF1 partitions Cd(II) into the vacuole and thus generates a Cd(II) sink in root cells. This may restrict the amount of Cd(II) that is available for movement into the shoot (thin arrow). Consequently, Cd(II) influx into leaf cells is reduced, and vacuoles in the shoot may not be the primary Cd(II) sink in the transgenic plants. (b) Cd partitioning in plants exhibiting naturally selected Cd hyperaccumulation (e.g. T. caerulescens; accession Ganges). In root cells of Cd hyperaccumulator plants, Cd(II) transport into the vacuole is likely to be suppressed. Instead, Cd(II) is likely to be exported by the metal pump HMA4, and possibly other transporters, for transport into the shoot via the xylem. A larger proportion of Cd(II) than in (a) is translocated from the root into the shoot (thick arrow). In leaf cells, efficient transporters exist for the sequestration of Cd(II) in the vacuoles, thus generating a strong sink for Cd(II) in the central vacuoles of leaf cells.

[54,55] and as a compartment that can be used to generate artificial metal sinks (see below and Figure 2). Segregating populations have also been obtained by crossing accessions of the hyperaccumulator *T. caerulescens* differing in Zn, Ni and Cd tolerance and accumulation [43°,56,57]. Finally, metal hyperaccumulator species have been evaluated systematically with respect to their suitability for molecular genetic approaches [58°,59].

The characterization of single genes involved in metal homeostasis has yielded important insights into their functions and potential use in phytoremediation [60[•]]. Among these, some of the most notable studies address the high-affinity iron uptake system IRT1 of *A. thaliana* [46,61,62^{••},63,64] and the two P_{1B}-type Zn²⁺/Cd²⁺. ATPases HMA2 and HMA4 [41[•],65,66[•],67,68], which function in the export of Zn²⁺ and Cd²⁺ from cells in root-to-shoot metal transport.

Important insights have been gained from transgenic plants overexpressing microbial and plant metal home-

ostasis proteins. Transgenic A. thaliana plants were generated that overexpress the yeast YCF1 (yeast cadmium factor 1 [69]) membrane transport protein of the ATPbinding cassette (ABC) transporter family [70^{••}]. This protein is capable of transporting Cd-glutathione conjugates into the vacuole of yeast and plant cells. Transgenic plants were less metal-sensitive and accumulated up to 1.5-fold and 1.4-fold higher shoot concentrations of Cd and Pb, respectively (Table 1; Figure 2). The overexpression of A. thaliana HMA4 (see above) was reported to increase the tolerance of transgenic plants to Cd and Zn, and leaf Zn and Cd concentrations were twofold and 1.4fold higher than in the wild type, respectively (Table 1) [66[•]]. All of these transgenic plants remain to be tested for shoot metal accumulation on metal-contaminated soils. Lee et al. [71"] successfully expressed a bacterial homologue of AtHMA4, the E. coli ZntA protein, in A. thaliana. The protein was shown to localize to the plasma membrane of A. thaliana cells. The transgenic lines were more tolerant to Pb and Cd than wild-type plants, but accumulated less Cd and Pb in the leaves [71**]. In addition to increasing the rate of metal removal from the cytoplasm, metal tolerance can also be generated by producing metal-chelating molecules. One low molecular weight chelator implicated in Ni hyperaccumulation and tolerance is free histidine [9,72]. Expression in A. thaliana of a bacterial gene encoding ATP phosphoribosyl transferase, which catalyzes the rate-limiting, first committed step in histidine biosynthesis, increased free histidine levels and conferred enhanced Ni tolerance [73[•]], but did not increase leaf Ni accumulation. Reported results on the overexpression of phytochelatin synthase in plants with the aim to overproduce metal chelating phytochelatins have so far been contradictory [74,75]. Although phytochelatins are necessary for basal metal tolerance in most plants [76], inhibitor studies suggest that phytochelatins are not required in naturally selected Zn and Cd hyperaccumulation and hypertolerance [77,78°].

Conclusions

As far as can be inferred from the published data, the performance of transgenic plants generated so far is not vet sufficient for commercial phytoextraction (Table 1). Improvements could be made by using tissue- or celltype-specific promoters. In roots, it is desirable to maintain trace element contaminants in a mobile chemical form, and their export into the xylem should be maximized (Figure 2). It is important to avoid the generation of metal sinks in the roots and to create sinks for metals and metalloids, either by tight binding or by sequestration, in the above-ground tissues. The engineering of transgenic plants suitable for phytoextraction will probably require a change in the expression levels of several genes. Beyond a certain number of genes, this could render transgenic approaches impractical, unless regulatory factors can be identified that control several target genes in concert. Enhancing contaminant mobilization and uptake into the roots will require more attention in the future, especially with respect to the competition between nutrient ions and target trace element contaminant ions.

Metal and metalloid contaminations seriously threaten the health of a large number of people worldwide and require novel, low-cost, flexible and effective phytoremediation technologies. Despite considerable and rapid progress in recent years, a lack of basic understanding of metal handling in plants is still limiting the design of phytoremediation approaches. This can only be overcome by concerted multilateral and more widespread national research programs, as well as through facilitated access to biological resources such as seeds and an open exchange of information, tools and materials.

Update

Kobae *et al.* [79] have shown that the *A. thaliana* T-DNA insertion line *mtp1-1*, which is disrupted in *MTP1* expression, is hypersensitive to Zn. This suggests that MTP1 contributes to basal Zn tolerance in *A. thaliana*.

Acknowledgements

I apologize to the colleagues whose work could not be cited due to space restrictions. This work was funded by a 'Biofuture' research grant from the German Ministry of Science and Education (0311877), and research is also supported by the European Union ('METALHOME', HPRN-CT-2002-00243).

References and recommended reading

Papers of particular interest, published within the annual period of review, have been highlighted as:

- · of special interest
- •• of outstanding interest
- 1. Nriagu JO, Pacyna JM: Quantitative assessment of worldwide contamination of air water and soils by trace metals. *Nature* 1988, **333**:134-139.
- 2. Meharg AA: Arsenic in rice understanding a new disaster for South-East Asia. *Trends Plant Sci* 2004, **9**:415-417.
- 3. Cheng S: Heavy metal pollution in China: origin, pattern and control. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 2003, **10**:192-198.
- McGrath SP, Zhao FJ: Phytoextraction of metals and metalloids from contaminated soils. Curr Opin Biotechnol 2003, 14:277-282.
- 5. Salt DE, Smith RD, Raskin I: **Phytoremediation**. *Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol* 1998, **49**:643-668.
- 6. Krämer U, Chardonnens AN: The use of transgenic plants in the bioremediation of soils contaminated with trace elements. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 2001, 55:661-672.
- 7. Clemens S, Palmgren MG, Kraemer U: A long way ahead:
- understanding and engineering plant metal accumulation. Trends Plant Sci 2002, 7:309-315.

This is an important review outlining step-by-step our knowledge concerning the major bottlenecks in the engineering of metal accumulation in plants.

- Baker AJM, Brooks RR: Terrestrial higher plants which hyperaccumulate metallic elements – a review of their distribution, ecology and phytochemistry. *Biorecovery* 1989, 1:81-126.
- Krämer U, Cotter-Howells JD, Charnock JM, Baker AJM, Smith JAC: Free histidine as a metal chelator in plants that accumulate nickel. *Nature* 1996, 379:635-638.

10. Becher M, Talke IN, Krall L, Krämer U: Cross-species microarray

transcript profiling reveals high constitutive expression of metal homeostasis genes in shoots of the zinc hyperaccumulator Arabidopsis halleri. Plant J 2004, 37:251-268.

Comparative microarray analysis of gene expression of leaves in the metal hyperaccumulator plant *A. halleri* and *A. thaliana*. Several candidate genes are identified: *AhZIP6*, *AhHMA3*, *AhNAS3* and *AhMTP1* (see text). Analysis of gene expression in *A. thaliana* and *A. halleri* exposed to low and high Zn levels using a quantitative real-time reverse transcriptase polymerase chain reaction shows constitutive overexpression of candidate genes in *A. halleri*. Expression in a Zn-hypersensitive strain of *S. cerevisae* indicates that some of the identified candidate genes, *AhNAS3*, *AhHMA3* and *AhMTP1*, encode proteins that function in cellular Zn detoxification.

- 11. Weber M, Harada E, Vess C, von Roepenack-Lahaye E,
- Clemens S: Comparative microarray analysis of Arabidopsis thaliana and Arabidopsis halleri roots identifies nicotianamine synthase, a ZIP transporter and other genes as potential metal hyperaccumulation factors. *Plant J* 2004, 37:269-281.

Comparative microarray analysis of gene expression in roots in the metal hyperaccumulator plant *A. halleri* and *A. thaliana*. Several candidate genes are identified: *AhZIP9* and *AhNAS2*. *AhNAS2* expression is shown to confer the ability to synthesize nicotianamine and Zn tolerance to a Zn-sensitive mutant of *S. pombe*. *A. halleri* is shown to contain higher concentrations of nicotianamine than *A. thaliana*.

- Broadhurst CL, Chaney RL, Angle JS, Maugel TK, Erbe EF, Murphy CA: Simultaneous hyperaccumulation of nickel, manganese, and calcium in *Alyssum* leaf trichomes. *Environ Sci Technol* 2004, 38:5797-5802.
- 13. Ma LQ, Komar KM, Tu C, Zhang W, Cai Y, Kennelley ED: A fern that hyperaccumulates arsenic. *Nature* 2001, **409**:579.
- Salido AL, Hasty KL, Lim JM, Butcher DJ: Phytoremediation of
 arsenic and lead in contaminated soil using Chinese brake ferns (*Pteris vittata*) and Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea*). Int J Phytoremediation 2003, 5:89-103.

One of the few reports of field trials: shoot arsenic concentrations were 20 times those in the soil and the estimated time for soil remediation was eight years.

- Rugh CL, Wilde HD, Stack NM, Thompson DM, Summers AO, Meagher RB: Mercuric ion reduction and resistance in transgenic Arabidopsis thaliana plants expressing a modified bacterial merA gene. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 1996, 93:3182-3187.
- 16. Bizily SP, Rugh CL, Meagher RB: **Phytodetoxification of hazardous organomercurials by genetically engineered plants**. *Nat Biotechnol* 2000, **18**:213-217.
- 17. Bizily SP, Kim T, Kandasamy MK, Meagher RB: Subcellular targeting of methylmercury lyase enhances its specific activity for organic mercury detoxification in plants. *Plant Physiol* 2003, 131:463-471.
- Ruiz ON, Hussein HS, Terry N, Daniell H: Phytoremediation of organomercurial compounds via chloroplast genetic engineering. *Plant Physiol* 2003, **132**:1344-1352.
- Meharg Andrew A, Macnair Mark R: Relationship between plant phosphorus status and the kinetics of arsenate influx in clones of *Deschampsia caespitosa* (L.) Beauv. that differ in their tolerance of arsenate. *Plant Soil* 1994, 162:99-106.
- 20. Dhankher OP, Li Y, Rosen BP, Shi J, Salt D, Senecoff JF,
- Sashti NA, Meagher RB: Engineering tolerance and hyperaccumulation of arsenic in plants by combining arsenate reductase and γ-glutamylcysteine synthetase expression. Nat Biotechnol 2002, 20:1140-1145.

Describes the elegant two-gene engineering of significant As accumulation in leaves of *A. thaliana*.

 21. Dhankher OP, Shasti NA, Rosen BP, Fuhrmann M, Meagher RB:
 Increased cadmium tolerance and accumulation by plants expressing bacterial arsenate reductase. *New Phytol* 2003, 159:431-441.

The authors observed increased Cd tolerance in *A. thaliana* and tobacco plants transformed with *pSRS1::ArsC* constructs. The transgenic tobacco lines accumulated up to 1.4-fold higher leaf Cd concentrations than wild-type in a hydroponic medium. The authors speculate that ArsCp

might act by reducing Cd(II) to Cd(0) - an exciting idea that awaits confirmation.

- 22. Ellis DR, Sors TG, Brunk DG, Albrecht C, Orser C, Lahner B,
- Wood KV, Harris HH, Pickering IJ, Salt DE: Production of Se-methylselenocysteine in transgenic plants expressing selenocysteine methyltransferase. BMC Plant Biol 2004, 4:1.

The analysis of Se speciation in wild-type and transgenic plants was performed in much detail using high pressure liquid chromatography (HPLC) coupled to inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry and HPLC coupled to electrospray ionization quadrupole time-of-flight mass spectrometry, as well as X-ray absorption spectroscopy. Unfortunately, no potential Se-containing volatiles were analyzed. Concerning tolerance to and accumulation of Se from soil selenate, the results found here and in the article by LeDuc et al. [23] are somewhat contradictory.

- LeDuc DL, Tarun AS, Montes-Bayon M, Meija J, Malit MF, Wu CP, AbdelSamie M, Chiang CY, Tagmount A, deSouza M *et al.*: 23.
- Overexpression of selenocysteine methyltransferase in Arabidopsis and Indian mustard increases selenium tolerance and accumulation. Plant Physiol 2004, 135:377-383.

The physiological analysis of transgenic plants was carried out somewhat more carefully and on more different substrates in this study (compare with Ellis et al. [22*]). A mechanistic explanation for the high accumulation of Se from selenate by the transgenic B. juncea plants is lacking

Poynton CY, Huang JW, Blaylock MJ, Kochian LV, Elless MP: 24.

Mechanisms of arsenic hyperaccumulation in Pteris species: root As influx and translocation. Planta 2004, 219:1080-1088. Using ⁷³As-labelled arsenate, the authors compare root uptake in As

hyperaccumulator and non-accumulator fern species. Although somewhat noisy, the data indicates that root arsenate uptake in the As hyperaccumulator P. vittata displays a higher affinity for arsenate (K_M ninefold lower than in the non-accumulator fern). In both types of ferns arsenate uptake is inhibited by phosphate.

- 25. Pickering IJ, Prince RC, George MJ, Smith RD, George GN, Salt DE: Reduction and coordination of arsenic in Indian mustard. Plant Physiol 2000, 122:1171-1177.
- 26. Grill E, Winnacker EL, Zenk MH: Phytochelatins, the principal heavy-metal complexing peptides of higher plants. Science 1985, 230:674-676.
- 27. Ha S-B, Smith AP, Howden R, Dietrich WM, Bugg S, O'Connell MJ, Goldsbrough PB, Cobbett CS: Phytochelatin synthase genes from Arabidopsis and the yeast Schizosaccharomyces pombe. Plant Cell 1999, 11:1153-1163.
- 28. Clemens S, Kim EJ, Neumann D, Schroeder JI: Tolerance to toxic metals by a gene family of phytochelatin synthases from plants and yeast. *EMBO J* 1999, **18**:3325-3333.
- 29. Vatamaniuk OK, Mari S, Lu Y-P, Rea PA: AtPCS1, a phytochelatin synthase from Arabidopsis: isolation and in vitro reconstitution. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 1999, 96:7110-7115.
- 30. Schmöger ME. Oven M. Grill E: Detoxification of arsenic by phytochelatins in plants. Plant Physiol 2000, 122:793-801.
- 31. Hartley-Whitaker J, Ainsworth G, Vooijs R, Ten Bookum W, Schat H, Meharg AA: Phytochelatins are involved in differential arsenate tolerance in Holcus lanatus. Plant Physiol 2001, 126:299-306.
- 32.
- Zhao FJ, Wang JR, Barker JHA, Schat H, Bleeker PM, McGrath SP: **The role of phytochelatins in arsenic tolerance** in the hyperaccumulator Pteris vittata. New Phytol 2003, 159:403-410.

This study shows that the inhibitor of γ -EC synthetase, L-buthioninesulfoximine (BSO), significantly decreases reduced glutathione, phytochelatin and As concentrations in P. vittata exposed to arsenate, and also reduces arsenate tolerance. However, control (-As) plants are also strongly inhibited by the chosen BSO concentration, and the additional effect of BSO under exposure to arsenate is not well resolved

33. Raab A, Feldmann J, Meharg AA: The nature of arsenicphytochelatin complexes in Holcus lanatus and Pteris cretica. Plant Physiol 2004, 134:1113-1122.

The authors investigate As-phytochelatin complexes in two species: Holcus lanatus and P. cretica. They report that in above-ground vegetative tissues most As is present in inorganically bound form in both species (at least 78% in H. lanatus and 99% in P. cretica). Based on high pressure liquid chromatography electrospray ionisation mass spectro-

- 34.
- Wysocki R, Clemens S, Augustyniak D, Golik P, Maciaszczyk E, Tamas MJ, Dziadkowiec D: **Metalloid tolerance based on phytochelatins is not functionally equivalent to the arsenite** transporter Acr3p. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 2003, 304:293-300

A short but very interesting paper. In both S. cerevisiae and Saccharomyces pombe expression of the cellular arsenite efflux system of S. cerevisiae, Acr3p, confers much higher As(III) and As(V) tolerance than expression of a phytochelatin synthase. Expression of the S. cerevisiae Acr3p appears to generate higher As(III) and As(V) tolerance in the Ashypersensitive phytochelatin-deficient mutant of S. pombe than in the wild type. It remains to be seen what the effect of Acr3p expression in wild-type and phytochelatin-deficient Arabidopsis would be.

- Lahner B, Gong J, Mahmoudian M, Smith EL, Abid KB, Rogers EE, 35.
- Guerinot ML, Harper JF, Ward JM, McIntyre L et al.: Genomic scale profiling of nutrient and trace elements in Arabidopsis thaliana. Nat Biotechnol 2003, 21:1215-1221.

In an ionome screen (see text) the authors identify novel mutants and novel alleles of known mutants altered in leaf elemental concentration profiles. Novel alleles of the man1 (frd3) mutant, which accumulates very high concentrations of Mn, Co and other metals, are identified.

- 36. Salt DE: Update on plant ionomics. Plant Physiol 2004, 136:2451-2456.
- 37. Pence NS, Larsen PB, Ebbs SD, Letham DL, Lasat MM, Garvin DF, Eide D, Kochian LV: The molecular physiology of heavy metal transport in the Zn/Cd hyperaccumulator Thlaspi caerulescens. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2000. 97:4956-4960.
- 38. Persans MW, Nieman K, Salt DE: Functional activity and role of cation-efflux family members in Ni hyperaccumulation in Thlaspi goesingense. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2001, 98:9995-10000
- 39. Assuncao AGL, Da Costa Martins P, De Folter S, Vooijs R, Schat H, Aarts MGM: Elevated expression of metal transporter genes in three accessions of the metal hyperaccumulator Thlaspi caerulescens. Plant Cell Environ 2001, 24:217-226
- 40. Dräger DB, Desbrosses-Fonrouge AG, Krach C, Chardonnens AN, Meyer RC, Saumitou-Laprade P, Krämer U: Two genes encoding Arabidopsis halleri MTP1 metal transport proteins co-segregate with zinc tolerance and account for high MTP1 transcript levels. *Plant J* 2004, **39**:425-439.

Three distinct copies of MTP1 genes are shown to be present at independently segregating loci in the genome of the Zn-tolerant A. halleri. By contrast, MTP1 is a single-copy gene in the closely related, Zn-sensitive species A. thaliana and A. lyrata. Two A. halleri MTP1 gene copies cosegregate with Zn tolerance in the backcross 1 (BC1) generation of a cross between A. halleri and A. lyrata. In an allele-specific RT-PCR, these two copies are shown to contribute high amounts of MTP1 transcripts, whereas the third A. halleri MTP1 locus is expressed at low background levels and does not co-segregate with Zn tolerance. The MTP1 protein is shown to mediate cellular Zn detoxification and is localized to the vacuolar membrane.

41. Papoyan A, Kochian LV: Identification of Thlaspi caerulescens genes that may be involved in heavy metal hyperaccumulation and tolerance. Characterization of a novel heavy metal transporting ATPase. Plant Physiol 2004, 136:3814-3823.

A good analysis of TcHMA4 expressed in yeast. Results reported in the literature are contradictory (see [68]).

- Guerinot ML: The ZIP family of metal transporters. 42. Biochim Biophys Acta 2000, 1465:190-198.
- Zha HG, Jiang RF, Zhao FJ, Vooijs R, Schat H, Barker JHA, 43. McGrath SP: Co-segregation analysis of cadmium and zinc accumulation in Thlaspi caerulescens interecotypic crosses. New Phytol 2004, 163:299-312.

The authors analyze the segregation of Zn and Cd tolerance and shoot accumulation in parents and 234 seedlings of the F2 generation of a cross between a Cd and Zn hyperaccumulating accession of T. caerulescens (Ganges) and a Zn hyperaccumulating accession (Prayon). The distribution of Cd hyperaccumulation in F2 progeny suggests that Cd hyperaccumulation is controlled by more than one gene, but phenotypic analysis is complicated by competition between Cd and Zn and by Cd

toxicity, because Cd hyperaccumulation did not co-segregate with Cd hypertolerance.

- 44. Macnair MR, Bert V, Huitson SB, Saumitou-Laprade P, Petit D: Zinc tolerance and hyperaccumulation are genetically independent characters. Proc Royal Soc Biol Sci Series B 1999, 266:2175-2179.
- 45. Bert V, Meerts P, Saumitou-Laprade P, Salis P, Gruber W,
- Verbruggen N: Genetic basis of Cd tolerance and
 - hyperaccumulation in Arabidopsis halleri. Plant Soil 2003, 249:9-18.

A very preliminary analysis of the parents, the F1 generation and of \sim 20 individuals of the backcross 1 generation of an interspecies cross between a Zn and Cd hyperaccumulating accession of A. halleri and the non-tolerant non-accumulating species A. lyrata ssp. petraea. Cd tolerance and hyperaccumulation do not co-segregate. Cd tolerance is estimated to involve two to three major genes. Cd hyperaccumulation is concluded to involve complex inheritance.

- Rogers EE, Eide DJ, Guerinot ML: Altered selectivity in an 46 Arabidopsis metal transporter. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 2000, 97:12356-12360.
- 47. Lombi E, Tearall KL, Howarth JR, Zhao FJ, Hawkesford MJ,
- McGrath SP: Influence of iron status on cadmium and zinc uptake by different ecotypes of the hyperaccumulator Thlaspi caerulescens. Plant Physiol 2002, 128:1359-1367.

The study suggests that the TcIRT1 protein should be studied more closely with respect to an important role in Cd hyperaccumulation.

- 48 Vacchina V, Mari S, Czernic P, Marques L, Pianelli K
- Schaumloffel D, Lebrun M, Lobinski R: Speciation of nickel in a hyperaccumulating plant by high-performance liquid chromatography-inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry and electrospray MS/MS assisted by cloning using yeast complementation. Anal Chem 2003, 75:2740-2745

Reports a screen of a cDNA library from T. caerulescens for cDNAs conferring Ni tolerance to yeast cells. A nicotianamine synthase is identified. A Ni-nicotianamine complex is isolated from Ni-exposed T. caerulescens plants. It should be noted, however, that the population of T. caerulescens used in the study is primarily Zn hyperaccumulating

- 49. Herbik A, Koch G, Mock HP, Dushkov D, Czihal A, Thielmann J, Stephan UW, Baumlein H: Isolation, characterization and cDNA cloning of nicotianamine synthase from barley. A key enzyme for iron homeostasis in plants. Eur J Biochem 1999, 265:231-239.
- 50. Ling H-Q, Koch G, Baeumlein H, Ganal MW: Map-based cloning of chloronerva, a gene involved in iron uptake of higher plants encoding nicotianamine synthase. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 1999. 96:7098-7103.
- 51. Higuchi K, Kanazawa K, Nishizawa N-K, Chino M, Mori S: Purification and characterization of nicotianamine synthase from Fe-deficient barley roots. Plant Soil 1994, 165:173-179
- Stephan UW, Scholz G: Nicotianamine: mediator of transport of 52. iron and heavy metals in the phloem? Physiol Plant 1993, 88:522-529
- Curie C, Panaviene Z, Loulergue C, Dellaporta SL, Briat JF, 53. Walker EL: Maize yellow stripe1 encodes a membrane protein directly involved in Fe(III) uptake. Nature 2001, 409:346-349.
- Krämer U, Pickering IJ, Prince RC, Raskin I, Salt DE: Subcellular localization and speciation of nickel in hyperaccumulator and non-accumulator Thlaspi species. Plant Physiol 2000, 122:1343-1353.
- 55. Ma JF, Ueno D, Zhao FJ, McGrath SP: Subcellular localisation of Cd and Zn in the leaves of a Cd-hyperaccumulating ecotype of Thlaspi caerulescens. Planta 2004 [Epub ahead of print]: DOI: 10.1007/s00425-004-1392-5.
- Assuncao AGL, Ten BWM, Nelissen HJM, Vooijs R, Schat H, Ernst 56. WHO: A cosegregation analysis of zinc (Zn) accumulation and Zn tolerance in the Zn hyperaccumulator Thlaspi caerulescens. New Phytol 2003, 159:383-390.
- 57. Frerot H, Petit C, Lefebvre C, Gruber W, Collin C, Escarre J: Zinc and cadmium accumulation in controlled crosses between metallicolous and nonmetallicolous populations of Thlaspi caerulescens (Brassicaceae). New Phytol 2003, **157**:643-648.

58. Peer WA, Mamoudian M, Lahner B, Reeves RD, Murphy AS,

Salt DE: Identifying model metal hyperaccumulating plants: germplasm analysis of 20 Brassicaceae accessions from a wide geographical area. New Phytol 2003, 159:421-430.

Twenty accessions of hyperaccumulator plants are compared with respect to their metal accumulation, growth, self-fertility, flowering time, seed production, genome size, sequence similarity with *A. thaliana* and genetic transformability. As a result, an accession of T. caerulescens is proposed as a model hyperaccumulator plant.

- 59. Gumaelius L, Lahner B, Salt DE, Banks JA: Arsenic hyperaccumulation in gametophytes of Pteris vittata. A new model system for analysis of arsenic hyperaccumulation. Plant Physiol 2004, 136:3198-3208.
- 60. Song WY, Martinoia E, Lee J, Kim D, Kim DY, Vogt E, Shim D,
- Choi KS, Hwang I, Lee Y: A novel family of Cys-rich membrane proteins mediates cadmium resistance in Arabidopsis. Plant Physiol 2004, 135:1027-1039.

Heterologous screening of an A. thaliana cDNA library in S. cerevisiae grown on high Cd concentrations is used to identify the AtPCR1 protein, demonstrating that this highly successful classical approach continues to identify novel proteins involved in metal detoxification. The small cysteine-rich plasma membrane protein AtPCR1 increases Cd tolerance when overexpressed in A. thaliana.

- 61. Connolly EL, Fett JP, Guerinot ML: Expression of the IRT1 metal transporter is controlled by metals at the levels of transcript and protein accumulation. *Plant Cell* 2002, **14**:1347-1357.
- 62. Vert G, Grotz N, Dedaldechamp F, Gaymard F, Guerinot ML,
 Briat JF, Curie C: IRT1, an *Arabidopsis* transporter essential for iron uptake from the soil and for plant growth. Plant Cell 2002, 14:1223-1233

This paper clearly demonstrates that IRT1 is the high-affinity iron uptake system in roots of A. thaliana.

- 63. Vert GA, Briat JF, Curie C: Dual regulation of the Arabidopsis high-affinity root iron uptake system by local and longdistance signals. Plant Physiol 2003, 132:796-804.
- 64. Korshunova YO, Eide D, Clark WG, Guerinot ML, Pakrasi HB: The IRT1 protein from Arabidopsis thaliana is a metal transporter with a broad substrate range. Plant Mol Biol 1999, 40:37-44.
- Hussain D, Haydon MJ, Wang Y, Wong E, Sherson SM, Young J,
 Camakaris J, Harper JF, Cobbett CS: P-type ATPase heavy metal transporters with roles in essential zinc homeostasis in

Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 2004, **16**:1327-1339. A careful reverse genetic analysis of the partially overlapping functions of HMA2 and HMA4 of A. thaliana, together with the localization of promoter activities. It is shown that the two transporters have a role in Zn delivery to the shoot and are vital for fertility. HMA2 is tentatively localized to the plasma membrane.

- 66. Verret F, Gravot A, Auroy P, Leonhardt N, David P, Nussaume L,
 Vavasseur A, Richaud P: Overexpression of AtHMA4 enhances root-to-shoot translocation of zinc and cadmium and plant metal tolerance. FEBS Lett 2004, 576:306-312

Analysis of an A. thaliana hma4 knockout and HMA4-overexpressing plants suggests a role for HMA4 in the transport of Zn and Cd from the root to the shoot. A green fluorescent protein fusion of HMA4 is localized to the plasma membrane. Sadly, the authors present data from only a single p35S::HMA4 transformant line.

- 67. Eren E, Arguello JM: Arabidopsis HMA2, a divalent heavy metaltransporting PIB-type ATPase, is involved in cytoplasmic Zn2+ homeostasis. Plant Physiol 2004, 136:3712-3723.
- 68. Bernard C, Roosens N, Czernic P, LeBrun M, Verbruggen N: A novel CPx-ATPase from the cadmium hyperaccumulator Thlaspi caerulescens. FEBS Lett 2004, 569:140-148.
- Li ZS, Szczypka M, Lu YP, Thiele DJ, Rea PA: The yeast cadmium 69. factor protein (YCF1) is a vacuolar glutathione S-conjugate pump. J Biol Chem 1996, 271:6509-6517.
- Song WY, Sohn EJ, Martinoia E, Lee YJ, Yang YY, Jasinski M, 70. Forestier C, Hwang I, Lee Y: Engineering tolerance and accumulation of lead and cadmium in transgenic plants. Nat Biotechnol 2003, 21:914-919.

This excellent paper contains a thorough analysis of YCF1-expressing yeast cells and A. thaliana transformant lines.

Lee J, Bae H, Jeong J, Lee JY, Yang YY, Hwang I, Martinoia E, Lee Y: Functional expression of a bacterial heavy metal

transporter in *Arabidopsis* enhances resistance to and decreases uptake of heavy metals. *Plant Physiol* 2003, 133:589-596.

Another example of a thorough analysis of transgenic plants expressing a microbial gene.

- Kerkeb L, Krämer U: The role of free histidine in xylem loading of nickel in Alyssum lesbiacum and Brassica juncea. Plant Physiol 2003, 131:716-724.
- Wycisk K, Kim EJ, Schroeder JI, Kramer U: Enhancing the first
 enzymatic step in the histidine biosynthesis pathway increases the free histidine pool and nickel tolerance in Arabidopsis thaliana. FEBS Lett 2004, 578:128-134.

Example of an engineering approach aimed at overproducing a Ni chelator.

- Gisbert C, Ros R, De Haro A, Walker DJ, Pilar Bernal M, Serrano R, Navarro-Avino J: A plant genetically modified that accumulates Pb is especially promising for phytoremediation. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 2003, 303:440-445.
- Lee S, Moon JS, Ko TS, Petros D, Goldsbrough PB, Korban SS: Overexpression of *Arabidopsis* phytochelatin synthase paradoxically leads to hypersensitivity to cadmium stress. *Plant Physiol* 2003, **131**:656-663.

- 76. Clemens S: Molecular mechanisms of plant metal tolerance and homeostasis. *Planta* 2001, **212**:475-486.
- De Knecht JA, Van Baren N, Ten Bookum WM, Wong FSHW, Koevoets PLM, Schat H, Verkleij JAC: Synthesis and degradation of phytochelatins in cadmium-sensitive and cadmium-tolerant *Silene vulgaris*. *Plant Sci* 1994, 106:9-18.
- Schat H, Llugany M, Vooijs R, Hartley-Whitaker J, Bleeker PM: The role of phytochelatins in constitutive and adaptive heavy metal tolerances in hyperaccumulator and non-hyperaccumulator metallophytes. J Exp Bot 2002, 53:2381-2392.

Here, the effect of the $\gamma\text{-ECS}$ inhibitor BSO is tested in a Cd-tolerant non-accumulating plant, a Cd-tolerant hyperaccumulator plant and two Astolerant plants. The differences observed indicate that naturally selected As tolerance is thiol-dependent (i.e. dependent on $\gamma\text{-EC}$, reduced glutathione or phytochelatins), whereas naturally selected Cd tolerance is not.

 Kobae Y, Uemura T, Sato MH, Ohnishi M, Mimura T, Nakagawa T, Maeshima M: Zinc transporter of Arabidopsis thaliana AtMTP1 is localized to vacuolar membranes and implicated in zinc homeostasis. *Plant Cell Physiol* 2004, 45:1749-1758.